

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at City Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 24 September 2014 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons dated 19 September 2014.

Present: County Councillor Margaret Jones (Lord Mayor in the Chair);

County Councillors Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Cowan, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Graham, Groves, Hinchey, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Knight, Keith Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Lent, Lloyd, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Morgan, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Weaver, Craig Williams, Darren Williams and Woodman

Apologies: County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Manzoor Ahmed, Ralph Cook, Davis, Kirsty Davies, Govier and Walsh.

(Council on 23 October 2014 amended these proceedings as indicated in *bold italics*)

61 : WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

Formal approval to record the proceedings was agreed.

62 : MINUTES – 24 JULY 2014

The minutes of the meeting held on 24 July 2014 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

63 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chairman reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 16 of the Members' Code of Conduct to declare any interest, and to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

The following declarations were made:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
County Councillor Woodman	Item 9	Personal Interest as an Honorary President of Diverse Cymru.
Councillors Aubrey, Bale, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Cowan, De' Ath, Ford, Goodway, Groves, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hyde, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones , Kelloway, Knight, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Benjamin Thomas, Huw Thomas, Walker, Craig Williams and Woodman.	Item 10 - Statement of Accounts 2013/14 and Annual Compliance Reports	Personal Interest as Members of the Local Government Pension Scheme.
Councillors Evans and McKerlich	Item 10 - Statement of Accounts 2013/14 and Annual Compliance Reports	Personal Interest as Members of the Local Government Pension Scheme, and Member of the Pension Panel.
Councillor Hinchey	Item 10 - Statement of Accounts 2013/14 and Annual Compliance Reports	Personal Interest as Members of the Local Government Pension Scheme, and as Chair of the Pension Panel.

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Sanders	Item 11 - Oral Questions , Question 13	Personal Interest as a School Governor of Heol Llanishen Fach Primary School

64 : ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. Gordon Houlston

It was with great sadness that Council was advised that former Lord Mayor of Cardiff Gordon Houlston passed away on 4th September 2014 after a period of ill-health.

In a long and distinguished Local Government career he served as Chairman of South Glamorgan County Council and Deputy Leader of Cardiff Council and championed the needs of the citizens of Cardiff and the most vulnerable in society.

The Lord Mayor advised that she I attended had sent on behalf of Council sincere condolences to his son and daughter for their sad loss.

(As a mark of respect Members observed a Minute Silence)

2. Condolences

Sadly the Lord Mayor advised that two colleagues had suffered family bereavements over the last few months.

Councillor Keith Jones who lost his sister during the summer, and Councillor Chris Davis who for the loss of his grandmother. Members' thoughts were with them at this sad time.

3. NATO

The Lord Mayor took the opportunity to thank all those involved in the NATO Summit making the events in our city such a success.

The Lord Mayor advised that she had many letters of thanks from those visiting Cardiff as part of the NATO Summit in Newport. The hosting of the Summit in Wales had certainly put it firmly on the world map, and everyone had a truly Welsh welcome and a memorable time.

4. Lord Mayor's Charity Events

The next Lord Mayor's Charity fundraising event for Tenvous has been arranged for Monday 29 September at Anatoni's Restaurant in Lakeside.

5. Monica Walsh

Councillor Monica Walsh has asked the Lord Mayor to thank Members and officers sincerely for their all kind messages during her period of absence.

6. Councillor Corria

The Lord Mayor wished former Councillor Siobhan Corria all the very best for the future.

Councillor Dilwar Ali was invited to say a few words as her Ward colleague. He thanked Siobhan for all her hard work support over the last two years.

65: PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Question 1: *Mr Ashley Wood to Cabinet Member - Transport, Planning & Sustainability*

At the Council meeting in June, whilst replying to a question from Councillor Bridges, you said that the current resident-only parking arrangement "*is an effective scheme and is used widely across the city*"; in addition you said: "*I would not expect to review the policy again before 2017.*"

Following the 2012 elections your two predecessors had indicated that they might review the parking policy in Gabalfa ward. It is clear to anyone living in the ward that the current arrangements are not – contrary to what you have claimed – effective, you have also been given evidence to show that over 90% of residents in one of the worst-affected areas want a change in the council's policy. Do you not agree that your statement in June was ill-informed, and will you agree to look again at this important issue?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

My previous reply to the Written Question from Councillor Bridges was not ill-informed, but was based on actual survey information. Your question does not reflect everything that I said in response, which was that the resident parking schemes are effective “*at protecting against external parking pressure, usually from commuters and shoppers*”.

A review of parking and the way we manage it is being undertaken as part of the preparation of a new parking strategy for Cardiff. This strategy will reflect recent changes including the impacts of the Local Development Plan on the city and the introduction of Civil Parking Enforcement.

It is important that a robust and consistent approach is applied on a city-wide basis, rather than looking at areas in isolation. This will naturally include a commitment to a review of the residents parking policy at an appropriate time as I indicated in my previous response.

Supplementary Question: *Mr Ashley Wood*

I am obviously disappointed that the residents of Gabalfa will have to put up with the parking issues until this is resolved, I think in 2017. However I do welcome your commitment to not look at areas in isolation but overall.

In that regard, Gabalfa ward like the Heath borders the University Hospital of Wales grounds, however it should be noted that Heath has 100% residents parking and many of the residents there have driveways; whilst Gabalfa has only 50% residents parking and many houses with multiple occupancy. This anomaly no doubt results in commuters being focussed into Gabalfa causing problems with parking there.

So can you commit to reviewing this obvious injustice when reviewing the parking policy?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I don't believe there is any injustice. The example you have given is very similar to many other wards. For example my own ward of Canton and neighbouring ward of Riverside, if you look at those areas we have stadium near it we have similar issues there too so obviously what we

have is correct and that is the only approach we can take, so we will follow that approach.

Public Question 2

The Lord Mayor advised that in accordance with the Council Procedure Rule 18 (i), as the public questioner was absent the question was deemed to be withdrawn.

Public Question 3

Question: *Mrs Jean Evans to the Leader of the Council*

With reference to Councillor Ali Ahmed, Deputy Lord Mayor for the City of Cardiff, is it right and proper that as an elected Civic Leader, Cllr Ahmed in his official capacity engaged in a public and controversial political rally contravening the council's protocol that Civic Leaders should remain neutral during their year of office?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I am unable to comment on the conduct of the Deputy Lord Mayor at this time as it is subject to complaint to the Council's Standards and Ethics Committee.

Supplementary Question: *Mrs Jean Evans*

Can a Councillor use his title of Councillor if he is speaking at a rally or meeting which is likely to be very controversial politically and perhaps would not represent the view of the majority of his ward, and it would not have been included in his manifesto whatever his political manifesto was?

Can he still use his title as Councillor to back up his views?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

As I said earlier I am unable to comment on this matter as it is being investigated at this moment in time so I am afraid I cannot add any further to what I have already said in my first response.

66 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

1. Councillor Chaundy – 2 additional signatories to a petition presented to Council in 26 June 2014 calling on the Council to improve road safety outside the school St Philip Evans Roman Catholic Primary on Llanedeyrn Drive.
2. Councillor Graham Thomas – over 200 residents requesting urgent improvements to road safety on Llantrisant Road near the junction of Crofft y Gennau Road and Rhydlyfar Drive following a number of road accidents on Llantrisant Road at this junction within the last 6 weeks. Residents urge the Council to act now to reduce the speed limits on this stretch of road from 60mph to 40mph in line with other speed limits along Llantrisant Road; and ask the Council to further investigate additional measures to reduce the risks of accidents and action improvements to be made as a matter of priority.
3. Councillor Dilwar Ali – 131 signatories of residents of Llandaff North calling on the Council to introduce a 20mph in the following streets:- Radyr Road, West Road, Hazlehurst Road; Hawthorn Road east; Ty Mawr Road; Evansfield Road; Belle Vue Crescent; Hawthorn Road West and surrounding minor roads.
4. Councillor Dilwar Ali – 227 signatories of residents of Llandaff North calling on the Council to remove two road narrowings on College Road, Llandaff North and replace them with alternative traffic calming measures. Residents have witnessed several accidents.
5. Councillor David Walker - 80 residents of Blossom Drive Lisvane petitioning for traffic calming on Cherry Orchard Road due to the severe hazard they face at the junction of Blossom Drive with that road. Councillor Walker vouched for the poor visibility and the fast traffic speeds at this junction.
6. Councillor Ford – approximately 400 signatures complaining about the poor and unacceptable bus service for the communities of Fairwater and Pentreban.

67 : NOTICE OF VACANCY OF COUNCILLOR

The Council was informed of the Notice of Vacancy in the Office of Councillor in the Electoral Division of Llandaff North received on 19 August 2014. The by-election was to be held on 2 October 2014.

RESOLVED – That the vacancy in the Office of Councillor in the Electoral Division of Llandaff North be noted.

68 : STATEMENT FROM THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment

On 1 September 2014, the Council received the Wales Audit Office (WAO) Corporate Assessment. The report from the WAO, which follows a review undertaken in March of this year, clearly lays out the areas we must focus on as an organisation.

Having already recognised many of the issues raised by the Corporate Assessment following my appointment as Leader of the Council in March this year, the Cabinet agreed a 3 year programme of organisational development. The programme sets out the Council's approach to addressing the key issues of performance management, governance, finance and service delivery as a matter of urgency.

The WAO report emphasised the importance of the three-year Organisational Development Programme to reshape the way the Council operates. With the publication of the Corporate Assessment, a review of the Organisational Development Plan has been taken to refine the approach and ensure that all the key issues raised in that assessment of the Council are clearly addressed.

The Leader stated that there were challenges facing the Council on a number of different fronts, but that he was reassured that the WAO were supportive of the steps being taken and had agreed to work with the Council moving forward.

Ensuring the delivery of the Organisational Development Programme, in a way which has a real impact on service outcomes will be a key priority, particularly in the light of a further WAO inspection in the summer of next year.

Cardiff's Membership of Core Cities UK

In September the Cabinet agreed to Cardiff formally joining the Core Cities Group following a successful application for membership. The Core Cities Group provides a united city-authority voice to promote the role of cities in driving economic growth within the UK. The eight English Core Cities – Birmingham, Bristol, Liverpool, Leeds, Manchester, Newcastle, Nottingham and Sheffield – having recently been joined by Cardiff and Glasgow, now form 'Core Cities UK'.

The ten Core Cities are important because they account for 28% of the economic value of the English, Welsh and Scottish economies combined. It is clear that it is cities that drive growth and jobs for their nations.

This week the ten members of the Core Cities Cabinet met for the first time to discuss the outcome of the Scottish Referendum and the urgent need for devolution to cities in England, Scotland and Wales. The meeting was attended by the leaders of all 10 member cities. The devolution debate in England is focussed on giving greater power and flexibilities to cities and city-regions, recognising their role as drivers of economic growth, and their potential to rebalance the economy away from London and the South East. We in Wales can't be left behind - our membership of the Core Cities gives Cardiff a voice in these important national debates.

To this end, Core Cities have written to William Hague MP, First Secretary of State and Leader of the House of Commons, who has been charged by the Prime Minister with delivering devolution and constitutional change following the Scottish Referendum 'No' result.

Central Square Regeneration

Work on the Central Square Regeneration scheme in the city centre has been marked with an official ground-breaking ceremony, signifying the latest step in the creation of the city's most important regeneration project and the creation of a new gateway to Wales. Around 135,000 square feet of Grade A office space will be delivered at the No.1 Central Square, with strong tenant interest in the development, reflecting a growing demand for high quality office requirements in Cardiff.

The next steps include a master plan for the Central Square development to be submitted which will deliver a new public realm and open space, as well as office, retail and residential space.

69 : EDUCATION STATEMENT

Education remains a key priority for the City of Cardiff Council. With the results in summer 2014 we have seen a quickening of the pace of improvement in education Cardiff and across the Central South region.

There has been an improvement in the proportion of pupils reaching the expected outcome/ level in the Foundation Phase, Key Stage 2 and Key Stage 3. The extent of the improvement is greatest at Key Stage 3, followed by the Foundation Phase, then Key Stage 2. Improvements were also achieved in most indicators at Key Stage 4 and Key Stage 5. We have seen the biggest improvement in the L2+ measure of five GCSEs including English, or Welsh and Mathematics for many years at 54%. In the top grades at A level Cardiff out-performed both Wales and England averages.

This is encouraging. We can clearly pinpoint where we have real strengths, with outstanding performance in some schools, but also highlighting where performance is simply not good enough, not only in schools with poor performance in absolute terms, but also those with moderate achievement, but who are essentially coasting. There is still marked variation within and between schools

We know what's needed: high expectations, robust self-evaluation, rigorous tracking and systematically moving effective practice around, in terms of teaching and learning, leadership and governance, and in partnership with the Consortium and Welsh Government we have a clear plan to do this. Cardiff, as the largest Local Authority in the Consortium, is committed to changing the school system 'paradigm' – with schools at the centre of improvement, supported and challenged by the LA and Consortium in partnership.

From this September the Consortium has an Executive Board, leading on developing and implementing policy and the operational running of the consortium, comprising myself as Chair, the Consortium's Managing Director and education experts including our own Joy Ballard (who put in a stellar performance with Willows high School) this summer.

Paul Orders is now the lead Chief Executive with the Consortium, and the Chief Executive and Cabinet Member will also be members of the Joint Consultative Committee which retains overall strategic responsibility and accountability for the Consortium.

The Director of Education and Cabinet Member are also working closely with Welsh Government on the Schools Challenge Cymru programme which has an important role to play in Cardiff's improvement journey.

Strategic investment in schools is key - to accelerate improvement in standards and to meet growing demand for places.

The Cabinet Member was encouraged by what has been achieved in many of Cardiff's schools over the past year, and believed that the conditions for change and improvement had been created to ensure that young people get the education that they deserve and that the city and the county requires.

The Cabinet Member responded to a number of questions on the statement. In response to a question on the assessment of strategic investment, the Cabinet Member outlined the need to use of all available resources such as capital investment levers strategically with a focus towards raising standards as first priority; but also to achieve other things in terms of Schools Organisation planning and school places etc.

The Cabinet Member clarified the role of the Executive Board which was part of the national model for the governance of the consortia which has been put in place by Welsh Government. The Joint Consultative Committee made up of a Cabinet Member and Leaders from each Consortium partner authority remained the decision making body.

The Council remained the guardian of performance and had several levers as the Education authority to use to support underperforming schools and School Governing Bodies.

The nurturing and assessing the needs of those pupils permanent excluded from school remained a challenge.

In closing the Cabinet Member wished to put on record her congratulations to school with high performance, namely Cardiff High School; Bishop of Llandaff; Corpus Christi; Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Glantaf; and the work of Joy Ballard Head teacher at Willows High School for the extraordinary steps taken to improve performance.

70 : ENVIRONMENT STATEMENT

Green Flag Status

The Cabinet Member was delighted to report that following independent assessment the Council had retained Green Flag status for its eight award holding sites, these being Bute Park, Roath Park, Grange Gardens, Parc Cefn Onn, Rumney Hill Gardens, Victoria Park, Cardiff Bay Barrage and Thornhill Cemetery and Crematorium, and Bute Park had been named as a Green Heritage site, the third site in Wales to receive such accreditation and in recognition of achieving the required standard in the management and interpretation of a site with local or national historic importance. This particular award evidences the success of the Councils Parks Partnership Programme and the Bute Park Restoration Project.

The Green Flag announcement was followed by the publication of a perception survey by the European Commission and whereby an audit of 79 European Cities was undertaken, the survey, via a range of questions gauged satisfaction on various aspects of urban life. Under the Green Spaces category 89 % of respondents were either very satisfied or rather satisfied with Cardiff's Parks & Green Space provision, this level of satisfaction ranked equal tenth in the survey 6% behind the top ranked City, Munchen, in Germany and the highest ranking of the six participating UK cities these being London, Manchester, Glasgow, Newcastle and Belfast. The Cabinet Member was not necessarily surprised by the outcome as a resident of the City, and the level of satisfaction underlines the value and importance that our citizens' place on these areas, indeed they play a vital part in ensuring the quality of life and liveability of our City.

Work Experience / Placements

The Cabinet Member was also pleased to report the breadth and depth of engagement and commitment that the Parks and Sports service has demonstrated in Q1 and 2 of the current financial year and through the work experience / placement opportunities provided in conjunction with partners / partner schemes. A total of nineteen participants had gained experience across a diverse range of activities on schemes / with organisations that include the Historic and Botanic Gardens Bursary Scheme, the Pathways to Apprenticeships Scheme, through our partners LANTRA (Land Training, the Sector Skills Council for Land Based Industries), the Horticultural Heritage Skills Scheme also administered by LANTRA, and the Young People Leaving Care Scheme. Individual

tailored placements had been provided for students from Llanishen High School, St. Teilo's High School, Cathays High School and the Horticultural College of Nantes, Cardiff's twin city in France; Vision 21 and QWEST, a project funded by the University of South Wales helping people get back into work. The programme developed by the service forms part of the overall Sport, Leisure and Culture Directorate Programme and supports the administrations priorities of supporting vulnerable adults, children and young people in times of austerity and education and skills for people of all ages to fulfil their potential and be well prepared for employment in the Cardiff economy and beyond. The type of programme in place within the Directorate should not be seen as an 'add on' but main-stream, in working with others much can be achieved.

Prosiect Gwyrdd

This month saw the commencement of the robust and very cost effective Prosiect Gwyrdd arrangements for treatment and disposal of our residual waste with Viridor at Trident Park in Cardiff, securing a further saving Cardiff Council as the Contracting Partner and our Partner Councils. This innovative contract with Monmouthshire, Caerphilly, Vale of Glamorgan and Newport Councils had been recognised nationally by being Finalists in the Association of Public Service Excellence (APSE) for the Best Public/Public Partnership Working initiative at the National Conference awards Ceremony. The Cabinet Member congratulated the internal team and partner Councils in the delivery and full commencement of this project, which also brings permanent jobs to the City and future exciting sustainability opportunities.

Cleanliness Standards in Cardiff

This month saw Cardiff as improving on its cleanliness standards in the independent report conducted by Keep Wales Tidy across the nation. Streets are selected at random and independently by the organisation, so this is a real test of our improvement. Once again the Cabinet Member acknowledged the dedication and daily efforts of frontline teams and managers in delivering essential service in the face of the challenges and those that continue to blight our City with litter and financial constraints we face.

The Cabinet Member responded to a number of questions on the statement. With regard to the Cleanliness Standards in Cardiff he indicated that he would look in to sharing the *findings* of the Keep Wales

Tidy report and provide a list of the streets *and wards* that were assessed as part of the report.

The Cabinet Member assured Members that officers would monitor and review the situation for green bin collections into the Autumn so that the fortnightly collections are not ended before demand has dropped for the winter period.

The Cabinet Member confirmed that as part of the Prosiect Gwyrdd operation that he was aware of the issue of the plumes when the operation first started and assured the Member that all the air quality monitoring procedures were in place and being undertaken in accordance with the legal requirements of Resources Wales.

The Cabinet Member expressed his keenness for the Apprenticeship and Work Placement Scheme and advised that the Cardiff Apprenticeship Scheme was only offered if the Council can offer permanent employment at the end. The scheme was open to all including Looked After Children.

71 : CARDIFF COUNCIL ANNUAL IMPROVEMENT REPORT
2013/14

(Councillor Woodman declared a personal interest in this item under the Member Code of Conduct as an Honorary President of Diverse Cymru. Councillor Woodman remained at the meeting for consideration of this item).

The Council was requested to approve Cardiff Council's Annual Improvement report for publication by 31 October 2014.

The Cabinet Member for Corporate Services & Performance, Councillor Hinchey proposed the report. The report was seconded by Councillor Patel.

The Cabinet Member presented the Improvement Report 2013/14 which was an evaluation of the Council's performance and provided detailed information on the progress made against the agreed outcomes, activities (improvement objectives), and targets. The report was considered by Cabinet on 18 September 2014.

The Cabinet Member advised that the report will be followed, within eight weeks, by a summary document which would be available on the website for Elected Members and citizens to view.

The report focussed on a number of areas including the supporting of the continued economic growth; the provision of quality jobs in the city's economy; launch of Cardiff Business Council; establishing Cardiff as a digital city; and supporting vulnerable people ; all of which are key priorities in the Corporate Plan. The report identifies progress in supporting affordable housing; improving housing; school performance including attendance; reducing the number of young people not in employment education or training (NEETS); and improving skills.

The Cabinet Member drew attention to satisfaction data relating to perceptions of Cardiff and its performance as a city.

The Lord Mayor invited debate and during the discussion Members commented on the need for clear and transparent performance data against the Corporate Plan objectives; measurable objectives with outcomes; an integrated management framework linking objectives and priorities with the budget - particularly in times of reducing resources; the need for clear improvement principles; strategies for improving communities; effective benchmarking against rest of Wales and Core Cities. Members were keen for information to be shared; interested to hear more about the work of the Peer Support Group and Challenge Forum.

Whilst Members recognised that in some areas there had been improvements, for example school performance and attendance; public visits to Libraries, Cardiff was still consistently the lowest performing Council in Wales. The Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment although not before Council for debate highlighted weaknesses in Land and Property asset management; fragmented leadership; performance improvements not being achieved; political management difficulties; the need for improved governance and decision making processes; pressures in areas of Social Care and Children's Service, particular in attracting Social Workers; case loads and issues relating to the service provision for the elderly; adaptations; disability grants; and support for carers; and the prospects of achieving the budget saving.

Other areas highlighted were the performance in Waste and Street Cleaning; Digital Cardiff and the need for high speed broadband; the

effect of national policies on performance and targets; concerns about future finance and resourcing; need to progress the outcomes of the recent WLGA Peer Review and looking towards the Wales Audit Office full Corporate Assessment.

The Cabinet Member responded to the matters raised in the debate, and underlined the fundamental importance of performance and improvement and the need for all Members to engage in the process.

RESOLVED – That Cardiff Council Annual Improvement Plan Report be approved for publication on 31 October 2014

72 : STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS 2013/14 AND ANNUAL COMPLIANCE REPORTS

(Councillors Aubrey, Bale, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Cowan, De’Ath, Ford, Goodway, Groves, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hyde, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Kelloway, Knight, Magill, Marshall, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Benjamin Thomas, Huw Thomas, Walker, Craig Williams and Woodman declared a personal interest under the Members Code of Conduct in this item as Members of the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund.

Councillors Evans and McKerlich declared a personal interest under the Members Code of Conduct in this item as Members of the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and a Member of the Pension Panel.

Councillor Hinchey declared a personal interest under the Members Code of Conduct in this item as Members of the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Chair of the Pension Panel.

The Councillors remained in the meeting during consideration but did not vote on this item.)

The Council was recommended to approve the audited Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2014; to note the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Cardiff Port Health Authority for the year ending 31 March 2014; to note the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2013/14; and to note that formal documents will be signed at the conclusion of the meeting.

The International Standard on Auditing (ISA) 260 requires the Appointed Auditor to report to those charged with governance, on the key matters arising from the audit examination of the Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2013.

In accordance with the Council's Treasury Management Policy Statement, the Annual Treasury Management Report for 2013/14 is presented based on the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) Code of Practice.

The Cabinet Member, Corporate Services & Performance commended the report to Council. This was seconded by Councillor Hunt.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) the audited Statement of Accounts for the ended 31 March 2014 as set out in Appendix 1 of the report be approved;
- (2) the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Cardiff Port Health Authority for the year ending 31 March 2014 as set out in Appendices 3, 5 and 6 of the report be noted;
- (3) the final Letter of Representation for Cardiff Council as set out in Appendix 4 of the report be noted;
- (4) the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2013/14 as set out in Appendix 7 of the report be noted;
- (5) it be noted that the following documents will be formally signed at the conclusion of the meeting:
 - Statement of Accounts for Cardiff Council including the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Lord Mayor and Interim Section 151 Officer
 - Annual Governance Statement (Within the accounts) – Leader of the Council and Interim Head of Paid Service
 - Accounts of Cardiff Port Health Authority – Interim Section 151 Officer

- Letters of Representation for Cardiff Council, Cardiff Port Health Authority – Leader of the Council and Interim Section 151 Officer
- Letter of Representation for Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Leader of the Council and Interim Head of Paid Services
- Audit Certificate for Cardiff Council and Cardiff Port Health Authority – Appointed Auditor, Wales Audit Office. To be signed at a later date.

73 : ORAL QUESTIONS

(Councillor Sanders declared a personal interest in question 13 under the Member Code of Conduct as a School Governor at Heol Llanishen Fach Primary School. Councillor Sanders remained at the meeting for consideration of this item).

1. QUESTION TO THE LEADER - ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS

Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

The Wales Audit Office Annual Improvement Report for Cardiff made painful reading and attacks the failure of performance management to consistently secure improvement. As part of the organisational change, Cardiff will become a member of the Core Cities Group to share information and learn from other cities. Data usage will be crucial as analysis and trend analysis will enable us to see how bad we actually are, and provide early warning signs. When do you envisage the first benefit of benchmarking data to emerge from the Core Cities group?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I would certainly agree with Councillor Woodman that benchmarking with other core cities is crucial in comparing Cardiff's performance, both as a city, but also as one of the largest public sector organisations. The other nine UK Core Cities are natural comparators as they face similar challenges and opportunities.

However, membership of Core Cities UK is really about much more than that. It is about realising benefits in terms of the debate on devolution that is taking place in England; about giving greater power and

flexibilities to cities and city regions; recognising their role as economic drivers of growth; and their potential to rebalance the economy away from London and the South East of England.

Our membership of Core Cities UK therefore gives Cardiff a powerful voice in a significant national debate.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

I do agree it is much more than data sharing. But given that the data sharing is crucial, as you say about the benchmarking, how confident are you that this Council will make the required significant progress within the first year as required by the Wales Audit Office?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I think it is already happening, if you look at some of the reports that certainly Cabinet Members are seeing now, we are seeing much more attention from officers in comparing Cardiff against some of those larger cities elsewhere, not just local authorities in Wales. I think it is a really important part of the work that officers are doing alongside the relevant Cabinet Member to make sure that when we are looking at performance that we are looking at it in a much bigger picture.

If we want to realise our vision, in terms of a liveable city, we have to look also beyond the United Kingdom. We have a vision in terms of Cardiff as most liveable capital European city, so we won't just be using that data to galvanise our performance within the network of cities across Europe. We will also increasingly see use of performance benchmarking across our Public Sector partners in Cardiff, because it is going to be extremely important for us to work much more closely together if we are going to address some of those critical, financial and demand challenges that we will face Cardiff in over the coming years.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Robson*

You will be aware that the Welsh Government has, in my opinion, by and large managed to spectacularly fail to recognise the uniqueness of cities in Wales, Cardiff particularly as a capital. It hasn't had City strategies which other devolved or non-devolved areas of the country have had, and as a result Cardiff has been forced in to joining a Core Cities group - which I support - I worry about the cost, but I do support the fact that we

are now linked in with Core Cities finally after years of banging on about it in this Chamber.

Will you now start lobbying the Welsh Government that we have had to do this ourselves, and that they should start listening and prepare a proper City strategy which will benefit the urban areas of Wales, because at the moment they are not acting cohesively to support our urban cities and their hinterlands?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Cardiff was not forced to join Core Cities UK. It is a membership organisation, we were able to apply and that application was successful. All of the Members, the other nine Members agreed to our membership.

In terms of Welsh Government, I think they have already shown a commitment. The Minister for Business has shown a commitment to developing a strong City Region agenda, and Cardiff as the Capital City I think is going to be playing, and is playing a very important part in ensuring that this is a success going forward.

2. QUESTION TO THE LEADER -ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Wales and Cardiff were given a rare and special opportunity to showcase themselves to the world by the recent NATO Summit. Most political parties welcomed the event, the decision to host it in South Wales and the positive media coverage which resulted. The exception to this support emanated from the leadership of Cardiff Council. By hosting an alternative anti-NATO meeting in County Hall and through the absence of welcoming gestures (except those of the Lord Mayor) international visitors may have been left with the impression that the city's Labour leadership saw the visit as an intrusion which offended its political sensibilities.

At the last Council meeting, the Leader was given the opportunity to give an unconditional welcome to the Summit and visiting world leaders during their time in Cardiff. But he turned it down. Does he now wish to recant and clearly state his appreciation for this once in a life time opportunity for the city of Cardiff?

Will he also outline some of the potential gains and how he intends to take advantage of them?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

Before I answer this question, I just wanted to reiterate some of the comments of the Lord Mayor in thanking our staff in particular for their efforts during the Summit. I know that the Prime Minister has written to officers at the Castle to thank them personally for their efforts, and I have also received a letter from the Royal Navy in relation to the success of the 'Meet the Forces' event for the hospitality that was shown by the city. I think that is important to note.

As I've mentioned previously, this has been one of the largest events to be held in the UK and we have certainly acted on the opportunity to showcase the best of Wales.

It was a pleasure to meet some of those overseas delegations at an event in Newport and outline the benefits the capital has to offer.

In terms of promoting the city, the Economic Development team, have worked with the Cardiff Business Council, engaged with key delegates at the Summit, as well as the attending visits international media as well.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

I just wonder whether the Leader has been looking at the press during this important visit, and whether he has heard the public reaction to Cardiff Councils lack of welcome and the sort of protests that were conducted in County Hall, and whether he has read and spoken to people about the strong reaction there was against that mood . And while that was happening - while Councillors from his group were protesting - in the Mansion House, Cardiff South AM's were welcoming ships crews, and doing all the sort of things that you would expect, in the presence of the Lord Mayor and Councillors. That was a very very solid occasion and one which all the visitors enjoyed and they did feel welcome. I think there were other things that were happening where the welcome was obviously withheld.

Will the Leader please acknowledge that there was a short coming in terms of the Council's response, particularly within his group, in terms of the welcome that wasn't given?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

No I don't accept that, I think it was very clear over the last couple of months that it was not a Cardiff Council event, it was hosted by the UK Government. We have worked very hard; our staff worked very hard to make sure that it showed Cardiff in a very very good light.

I know that officers and Cabinet Members in particular worked very hard to make sure that the city was returned back to business as usual after the event because it did have a significant impact on the movement of traffic for example in the city centre.

I was at the event in the Mansion House meeting some of the overseas ships that were in the city, and also I understand that my welcome greeting was in every hotel in the city as well.

I think that as a capital we have done everything we can to make sure that people had that very strong welcome.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

I too was at the same event in the Mansion House and I was a delight that so many people also wanted to see the ships on the following Sunday.

Given that event in the Mansion House commenced at 6 o'clock, could the Leader explain why he was nearly half an hour late to welcome our guests?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I am not aware in terms of the timing of that. I certainly was there, and I spent a great deal of time with them. I hope you will acknowledge that and I very much shared a great deal of warm reciprocal conversation with them.

I don't accept, I think that that is a bit harsh on me if I am honest Councillor Woodman, I did turn up, and I certainly made sure that I gave everyone a warm welcome.

3. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER EDUCATION AND SKILLS

Question: *County Councillor Holden*

What percentage of children in all schools across Cardiff use the free bus services provided?

Please breakdown the answer down into individual schools including all council run schools.

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore (on behalf of Councillor Magill)*

Of the 47,032 Primary and Secondary School aged pupils (aged between 5-16) in Cardiff, 3649 pupils receive free transport on dedicated school bus services, which is a percentage of 7.76%.

The percentage of Primary School pupils provided with free transport is 1.13%.

The percentage of Secondary School pupils provided with free transport is 17.09%.

I would be happy to provide you with a table showing the breakdown by school following this meeting.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Gareth Holden*

I just wanted to ask in light of the recent cuts last month in the non-statutory bus services, how does this policy fit with encouraging parents to send their children to school on public transport and thus reducing congestion within our city?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

I will ask Councillor Magill to respond to you in due course.

4. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN AND FAMILIES

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

What can be done to correct inaccuracies to Children's Services Intake and Assessments reports before inaccuracies form part of the rolling process?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

There is no evidence that report inaccuracies are commonplace in Children's Services Intake and Assessment Reports.

All assessment reports should be shared with those key family members who are eligible to access them and that provides family members with the opportunity to challenge the reports on matters of accuracy or opinion.

It is for the author of the report to accept any challenges or not and if a family member remains unhappy with the content of the report they can seek to challenge it further through the well established statutory complaints procedure.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

The complaints procedure is very long and drawn out, and very often when some crucial errors are made in the process, it is far too late when you get through the complaint procedure, and I understand what you are saying about the all Wales procedures. I think what that tells us is that things need to be done in a much better way on an all Wales basis.

So as somebody that used to practice in the field, I am wondering whether or not you have any particular ideas yourself as to how service in this particular regard can be improved, because it does need improving, as a lot of families are being let down?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

I am not quite sure what you mean about your all Wales comment in my answer. What I would say is that I don't agree that the complaints procedure is long and drawn out. I think it's a very robust complaints procedure, the early stages of it are carried out within days and it is only if it goes to Stage 2 or Stage 3 does it take longer.

I think it is pretty well tested so I wouldn't agree with you.

5. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

Question: *County Councillor Hunt*

Could the Cabinet Member give an assurance that the issue of cycling through the city centre will be properly addressed?

The vehicular roads are dangerous and not cycle friendly and cycling is largely prohibited in pedestrian areas. Any responsible cyclist travelling in any direction through the city centre will have to get off their bike for large parts of the journey. I have been Munich recently where cycle paths comfortably co-exist alongside pedestrian areas in the city centre and the incidence of cycling is high. Could similar measures be introduced in Cardiff?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Cycling is permitted along The Hayes, St Mary Street and High Street, which together provide routes through the city centre for cyclists in a north/south direction.

Cycling in an east/west direction is made difficult by the absence of a formal continuous cycle route.

The redevelopment of Central Square and the forthcoming BBC development have the potential to offer a key opportunity to make significant improvements to the east/west routes for cycling. Later phases of the development of Central Square may offer the opportunity for further improvements

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Hunt*

It may be permissible to cycle down The Hayes, but it is not the same thing as trying to do it at 3 o'clock on a Saturday afternoon when it is extremely difficult, mostly due to the congestion there.

The point I think I was making, certainly in respect of Germany was that there you have in pedestrianised areas allocated cycle lanes going through pedestrianised areas and separation of pedestrians from cyclists..

I am glad to hear there will be some input hopefully from monies available from developments in the city centre. I hope that when that happens that those developments will include ideas like having pedestrianised areas next to cycle paths in areas like The Hayes and areas like St Mary Street. I hope that that is the case?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Certainly I welcome that feedback. Also I think it is very important to take on board the requirements of the Active Wales Bill which is very very positive - it is a way forward for the 50/50 modal split and its direction is the kind of things you have talked about. Certainly when it comes to these developments, by then hopefully once the LDP is endorsed, we will also have the CIL (Community Infrastructure Levy) in place as well and that will also look at the whole city in a general approach.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

Since the Cabinet Member mentioned the Active Travel Bill, which comes into law today I believe, I was wondering if he could enlighten the Chamber as to what specific actions he will be taking to implement that Active Travel Bill in Cardiff, and how we are going to see that city wide cycle map emerging or will it just be a glorious map in his office of potential routes?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

It certainly will not be a technical report and glorious map in my office.

The officers and myself are working on this at the moment very closely and of course as I have said many times in this chamber during the LDP debates that the master planning process and the Active Wales Bill is all part of it. Therefore all of that will come together and that is why this city will be very much better than it has been in the past and will not have the gridlock situation that you keep talking about. That's why we need an LDP in place, without an LDP we have gridlocked situations because the master planning has not been in place.

6. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

Question: *County Councillor Clark*

On 7 August 2014, Wales Online reported the arrangements for Visitors' Parking Permits in Cardiff. It said 'After consultation, a £7.50 per year permit will be created for people who only want one visitor permit and don't have a Resident's Permit of their own'. Please could you outline how long the Council consultation lasted?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Following an inspection of the Resident Parking Place Orders, officers were provided with legal advice which confirmed that the new 'visitor only' permit would be a variation of the existing visitor permit class. As a result, the new permit was created via Statutory Notification, rather than by Statutory Consultation with an associated objection period.

The Statutory Notice was published in the Western Mail newspaper on 1 August with a notification period lasting 21 days. The new permit type then came into force on 25 August.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Clark*

I have to say that I am intrigued about that consultation with regard to visitors' permits that was referred to in the Echo and that you have just mentioned.

I do not remember seeing anything before that reference in the Echo to the consultation; and in fact my understanding was that the decision to increase the parking permit was made at the February 2014 Full Council Meeting from £5.00 to £30.00; and actually that was why residents were actually being charged £30 prior to August 2014.

So I am just quite intrigued as to what happened there - was it actually implemented properly as is my understanding? Also with regard to the consultation how were general residents consulted about that please?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

As far as the consultation goes I made it very clear in response to your earlier question.

What you have got to understand is this, we have obviously listened to what residents were saying, as did the administration. I listened very closely to the Members who expressed a concern and the residents who expressed a concern, and by doing that, what we have decided to do was I looked at it and I said if you have got no vehicle in the household then the charge would be £7.50, if you have got a vehicle in the household the charge would be £30 if you go for the second permit basically.

Therefore there was a clear policy, which we have decided to do that.

What is more important we are also giving a refund for those people who have actually paid the £30, if they have no vehicle in the household and they have paid £30, we are actually giving a refund to them as well. So clearly we as an administration listened very very carefully to those. So therefore as far as I am concerned we have done the positive thing here.

7. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

Question: *County Councillor Graham Thomas*

The A4119 Llantrisant Road is a key arterial corridor into Cardiff from the north west. It is already a heavily over used road with several pinch points. Future building and development plans only set to add to existing congestion issues. Given the scale of the LDP in North West Cardiff, does the Cabinet member agree that proper long term planning is required along its whole length to expand or straighten this single lane, winding road with poor pavements, before new developments make this impossible?

Additionally, in relation to the same road, over the summer there has been a series of terrible accidents involving motorists and cyclists, in particular at its junction with Crofft y Genau Road from St Fagans. This is an extremely busy junction, with little effective traffic control measures and traffic travelling at the national speed limit through the junction. Would the Cabinet please commit reviewing safety at this particular junction as a matter of urgent priority.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The LDP includes a master planning framework outlining the Council's infrastructure requirements for each LDP strategic site. The transport measures required for sites in North West Cardiff include:

- A park and ride facility north of Junction 33 of the M4;
- Rapid transit routes; and
- Extensions to the existing bus network and services.

This is likely to improve physical alterations to the A4119 Llantrisant Road in order to provide bus priority measures, better walking and

cycling facilities and improved road safety - the point which the other Councillor just touched on, the Active Wales Bill.

Details of these will be determined through the Council working with developers on the detailed master plans of key sites and via the planning application process.

The recent collisions on Llantrisant Road have been investigated, with the outcome being that there is justification to introduce highway improvement scheme.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Graham Thomas*

I just want to restate the urgency. Obviously you do know about the collisions that have happened there - they were really serious. Far too many ambulances have been called to that junction; roads have been closed etc. and it is happening on numerous occasions. In the last six weeks there have been three alone, and I think it is extremely lucky that nobody has been killed so far, but it is getting worse as the road gets busier. It is a terrible junction outside Rhydlafar Drive and Crofft y Genau Road from St Fagans as well.

Could you ask your Officers to conduct a site assessment, if it has not been done already, and I would like to be there if it hasn't been done and obviously if something has happened already I would like to find out what the plan for road improvements at that junction are, I don't know if you have any details of that now.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The highway improvement scheme is currently ranked as 5 on the Transport Projects Future Programme and will be implemented when finance is available and the accidents which you are talking on were on the 16 March, 5 September and 9 September, and as you said there were two slight collisions and one serious collision, and of course we are certainly concerned about that and that is why we prioritised this.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Listening to your first answer Councillor, you did confirm that the rapid transport corridor is still a live issue, am I correct?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

We are looking at all options.

8. QUESTION TO THE LEADER, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
& PARTNERSHIPS

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

I understand that the Cabinet has appointed a Peer Review Team to help oversee the improvement programme following the devastating Peer Review and Wales Audit Office reports were are damning about the performance of the Council over the past decade.

Can you inform the Council of the names of the individuals that comprise the Review Team, the daily rates paid to each and the total to be paid by WLGA of the entire exercise?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The peer challenge team has been commissioned and is being funded by the WLGA and includes:

- Barry Quirk – Chief Executive of Lewisham Council in London;
- Rod Alcott – WLGA Associate and formerly with the Wales Audit Office;
- Eifion Evans – Director of Education in Ceredigion; and
- Graham Williams – WLGA Associate and a former Chief Inspector with the CSSIW.

A work programme has been agreed with the WLGA and updates on the different work streams will be reported to the relevant scrutiny committees.

I have also spoken to the Chief Executive and the relevant Cabinet Member will ensure that Members are updated at appropriate stages of this work.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

I think only part of the question was answered, the information regarding the rates of pay wasn't answered.

Can you also confirm the number of other consultants and interims currently engaged by the Council, the nature of the work and the total

cost to the Council and in your response back to that could you also include the daily rates that I have mentioned in my substantive question?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

In terms of the team itself they don't have any contracts or specific time commitments with the Council but they are retained through the WLGA to undertake specific tasks to support improvement within the organisation. They have not been appointed on a daily rate but they are employed, I understand, on the basis of the completion of a number of specific tasks.

9. QUESTION TO THE LEADER, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & PARTNERSHIPS

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Cardiff Council forwarded a complaint to the Ombudsman alleging that I had distributed false and misleading material on the local development plan. The Ombudsman concluded that no breach of the code of conduct had taken place because the Ombudsman considered that the material published by me was not misleading and did not contain untruthful or misrepresentative statements. What is the Cabinet Member's view of the Ombudsman's findings?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I have not seen the Ombudsman's decision in relation to this matter so cannot comment on either his findings or the specific allegations that were made in this particular complaint.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

The fact that there is a question posted and you have possibly the arrogance to come to this Chamber and tell us that you have not seen the report. I find absolutely shocking.

Would the Leader care to put some Members of his group in order, who throw smears around and have a culture of politics by complaints?

The complaint that was put forward by this Council to the Ombudsman was baseless and the Ombudsman was pretty clear in what they said.

You are the Leader of this Council, there is a question on this paper and you disrespect this Chamber by coming here and saying you have not read the report. Maybe we should adjourn so that you can read it?

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

I do not want to get involved in the issues that Councillor McEvoy is raising, but could you explain to this Chamber why, having presumably received this question on Monday, which is the deadline, you didn't chose to read the report and have the courtesy to at least provide a verbal response. It strikes me as a certain courtesy irrespective of the bad blood that may exist whatever.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I do not accept that, at the end of the day there is a question here is talking about an Ombudsman ruling, that ruling stands regardless of what my views are on it. I am happy to meet with Councillor McEvoy if he has got particular issues with Members of my group, but as far as I am concerned I don't think it is appropriate to comment on those findings.

10. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, HEALTH
HOUSING & WELLBEING

The Lord Mayor confirmed that Question 10 from County Councillor Ali had been withdrawn.

11. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, SAFETY,
ENGAGEMENT AND DEMOCRACY

Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

Does the Cabinet Member believe an 'area-based' approach is a key principle when it comes to installing alley-gates and, if so, explain why?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

The area-based approach to alley-gating has a number of advantages, most importantly avoiding displacement of problems from one lane to adjoining lanes.

However, alley-gating schemes need to be tailored to the particular circumstances in individual areas and, in some cases, the gating of single lanes or a limited number of lanes may be sufficient to address identified problems.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

That is a slight roll back from the position stated by your predecessor a year ago in reply to a question on gating who said *'the 'area based' approach to alley gating, which has been implemented in wards of the city that have a large number of lanes and where gating lanes in isolation can displace the issues onto the surrounding lanes'*.

In the reply, it was to Councillor Holden, it was fairly specific that gating lanes in isolation is not a desirable step. With this in mind, would you agree to look at the specific issue of the lane that runs between Penylan Terrace and Cyncoed Road where the earmarked gate has not been installed for a rather frustrating technical reason despite the fact that its neighbouring lane has been gated and those fears that partially gating an area simply leads to displacement are, it appears, being realised.

Your response in this specific case would tell us a great deal about whether the administration commitment to gating by area is a firm commitment or not.

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

I understand from officers the reasons they have not gated the area you refer to on an area basis is because of the low crime statistics. I know that you have corresponded with officers for some time on this and I am happy to meet with you and try and take this forward in some way.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Holden*

We are currently having gates erected in our ward at the moment and I would like to ask going forward would you happen to have details of how much would be in the pot for gating in the next financial year and the one after that, and if possible could you provide those details please?

Reply: *County Councillor De'Ath*

Not at the moment but I will certainly make you aware of them when I can.

12. QUESTION TO THE LEADER, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
& PARTNERSHIPS

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

In commenting that ‘fragmented leadership and management have meant that weak performance in key service areas have not improved’, the Welsh Audit Office Report lays clear responsibility for the negative conclusions in this highly critical report at the door of this unstable Labour administration. When half of a political group is constantly working to undermine the ruling half, hoping for it to fail, such instability can only get worse to the detriment of the people you were elected to serve. When this administration took control there was much fanfare about putting right the shortcomings of its predecessors but this WAO Report nails the truth that ‘the Council has been unable to develop the culture and framework necessary for continuous improvement’. Will the Leader take this opportunity to be frank and open about the causes of the ‘political instability’ highlighted in this report and in particular how he intends to stop the infighting which brought down his predecessor and threatens his own tenure?

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I have to say that I am saddened that the Opposition Leader has taken to political point scoring on a report which references long standing issues both in terms of management and in terms of leadership over a number of years.

Our response to the WAO report must involve all Members in this Chamber and questions such as this from the Opposition will do nothing to convince the WAO that opposition Councillors are really serious about addressing the issues in that report.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

I think we should take the report seriously in terms of this political instability issue. There is no point skirting around it because if the Leader can’t guarantee the support of his group as he introduces these massive changes which are coming ahead then this Council and its future

is at risk. That is the reason that I put the question down I don't think it was necessarily point scoring, but it was getting him to address the issue because we all share in it.

When these splits emerged initially the Opposition Party's might have been slightly amused but now we are very concerned. So I do ask you to reassure us that when you are introducing future change will you have the support of your group in doing so because if you don't we are going to have big problems ahead.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

The terminology in that report when it talks about Leadership when it talks about Management actually goes way before 2012, and in fact when we look at the three Leaders of the Council one of them was the Leader of the Lib Dems that was deposed by the people of Cardiff because they didn't support the Lib Dems in the administration. So some of the findings I think do predate the administration, as well I don't think it is fair to paint that picture as one of an unstable administration just under this Labour Council.

I think if a Council is serious, if Councillors are serious about the changes that we face then we have all have got to realise that we have to take on board those local leadership roles. It's not going to be easy it's going to be very very difficult we have heard from a several Members in the Chamber tonight but the figures that are coming through from Central Government are that the changes we have to make are very much on us and in fact are already happening, if you look at changes like the Sports Cardiff transferred to Cardiff Metropolitan recently we are already having to change what we do and how much we do it centrally through the Council itself and I think that is just a taste of things to come.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Carter*

On a similar vein, two weeks ago I had the pleasure of scrutinising the Councils report on Social Services with CASSC and CYP and we did come across the issue of professional and political leadership in the Councillors part of the report under 6.4, and there was a sense by Members, I think of all sides, that maybe the report was slightly optimistic in that it talked about the administration having strong professional leadership, actually citing Children's Services as an area where actually leadership has been very useful in the last few years in

driving change, despite the fact that we have had 4 Cabinet Members in 2 years and 3 in Adult Services. Leader, your two Cabinet Members gave a verbal assurance that they would look to reword and finesse the report to reflect the reality that it has been an interesting time and that you are now driving things forward to the future, and I wondered if you would give a reassurance that you, as Leader, would see that that report did reflect reality and was slightly more modest and talk about your ambition rather than necessarily giving a false impression that the last two years have been rosy.

Reply: *County Councillor Bale*

I was not at that meeting and I am not sure what commitments were or were not given but am happy to look and get back to you.

13. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, EDUCATION & SKILLS

Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

How was evidence generated to make the conclusion that Llanishen Fach primary school was unable to be included in the provision of additional primary school places for the Llanishen area?

How was the evidence validated to ensure accuracy for the conclusion reached?

What discussions were held with the school, its Head teacher or the Governing Body to ensure the assertions were accurate?

I should also declare that I am a Local Authority governor at Llanishen Fach primary school.

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore (on behalf of County Councillor Magill)*

Catchment projections are based on verified Pupil Level Annual School Census (PLASC) information supplied by primary schools confirming the existing take up of places, NHS GP registration data and the home addresses of pre-school children. The submission of accurate verified PLASC data for analysis by the Welsh Government is a mandatory responsibility of primary schools.

The data identify that the seat of existing demand and the highest growth in projected demand lies within the discrete catchment areas of Coed Glas Primary School and Ton Yr Ywen Primary School.

I gather that several schools submitted written responses and that meetings with all concerned are being arranged.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

Whilst I know that we will have a meeting which will identify some of the answers hopefully to the questions that we have, my question wasn't necessarily about the data, although I am grateful for all that detail, it was more about the conversations that may or may not have taken place about the specific decision about some of the school buildings, I just wanted to clarify that, so my question was going to be so can we have a meeting but I understand in the recess I had that confirmation.

14. QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER, EARLY YEARS,
CHILDREN AND FAMILIES

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

What is the Cabinet Member doing about the independent investigator report finding that Cardiff Children's Services is guilty of inaccuracy in its reporting, of not keeping key records on file and that a very serious allegation of child abuse was not investigated to the standard that it should have been?

She should be aware of the report. I can forward it if there is any confusion.

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

It really isn't appropriate for these highly sensitive and confidential matters to be raised at Council in this way.

I take all safeguarding matters very seriously and, as you know, I have already invited you to meet with me to discuss your concerns and I would renew that invitation today.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I would ask the Cabinet Member if she has the faintest idea why I put this question today?

We are talking about years and months and months and months of coming up against a very worrying culture that we have in Children's Services in this Council, and matters like this should not be brushed under the carpet, and today I will not go into details that would shock this Chamber.

I have already stated my question, has she the faintest idea as to why this question is here today because the answers she has given are completely complacent in these circumstances?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

These are confidential matter, and I think possibly people in the Chamber will think that the reference to a report is some sort of reference to a published report that is in the public domain, but what it actually refers to is a report on a complaint and that is confidential information. It is not even information that I am allowed to see unless the person who has put in the complaint asks me to look at it.

I have offered to meet with you but I would have to check that you have the permission of whoever has made the complaint. It is very serious that these sorts of matters should not just be banded about, they shouldn't be banded about on Social Media, they should be banded about in this Chamber.

I will repeat my offer to you to come in and discuss them.

15. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, ENVIRONMENT

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

In view of the cost of £175,000 spend on green plastic bags for recycling and white bags for garden waste, could the Council consider a sustainable solution?

My constituents would like to put recyclables in separate boxes and use strong plastic garden bags for garden waste which can be reused each week. The boxes and bags for would be emptied and put on the kerbside for use again. This would be a far more sustainable and cost effective

method to the ongoing cost of providing bags that have a single use. Most other local authorities have this collection system rather than bags.

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I'm glad to hear that your constituents support sustainable recycling solutions and as we can see from the motion later on we need all the help we can get from all your constituents and others. I am passionate about recycling as I know you are, and we have discussed it previously.

To this end, officers are developing proposals to move to reusable garden waste sacks as an alternative to the green bags used currently in the biobag scheme. Consideration is also being given to options for the introduction of reusable containers for recycling that would replace the green bag scheme.

Further proposals are due to be brought forward to Cabinet for consideration in the coming months as part of the Outline Waste Strategy and will be subject to consultation.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Aubrey*

I would like to thank Councillor Gordon for leading me, for teaching me a lesson tonight, I never realised before that you could use for astro-turfing, which is what unfortunately this clearly is.

Will the Cabinet Member, who has made a dramatic and important announcement for residents of this city that he hasn't made previously, and his colleagues haven't made previously, will he undertake that when this change, which has been coming for quite some time, is made, will he undertake to ensure that all residents who are in a position can have a full audit of their arrangements for storing such facilities because there are a number of residents, including by the way myself, who would not be in a position to actually store some of the items that are being discussed and will he ensure that is a full public consultation and not the anecdotal?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

In terms of what we are doing at the moment, as I said, we are looking at various issues in fact I invited your environment spokesperson to come and speak to me some time ago to have a chat about what we were

actually looking at, just to give them the heads up, along with the Leaders of the other groups.

I am not making an announcement about what we are doing, all I have said is that these are the things we are looking at the moment, consideration is being given to these proposals and there are a number of issues that we are looking at in order to improve the recycling targets that we are currently achieving and those are things that we will obviously come back to in due course.

16. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE

Question: *County Councillor Howells*

Following the BBC Wales X-Ray Programme in August which highlighted the overwhelming unhealthy snacks being sold in our Leisure Facilities, what actions have now been put in place to improve the situation?

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

We are currently reviewing our catering offer, including having discussions with Fairtrade colleagues to ensure that we stock products accordingly.

I have to say though the BBC Wales programme was, in my view, very selective, no mention was made of the fact that Western Leisure Centre currently holds the Health Options Gold Award from the Health Improvement Team. In addition, Fairwater and Llanishen hold 'Silver' and 'Bronze' level awards respectively until the same scheme. I think that needs to be taken into account when we review these things based on an investigation programme that BBC Wales put on in terms of this case.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Howells*

Thank you for your reassurance that there are some healthy snacks available in some of our Leisure Centres.

But I do not know whether the actual quote which was given on behalf of the Council to the programme was run by you first because it was quite frankly it was alarming, because basically it says that the Council has to

balance promoting healthy being with making enough money and it went on to add that we have tried to offer healthy options in past years but customers clearly don't want them.

Now that is not good enough response and I would have preferred and expected a better response like the one you gave now. It is alarming that in the investigation that only 1 slot in 406 slots in vending machines had what is classified as a healthy option. That is clearly not good enough, clearly against Welsh Government guidance in promoting healthy eating, and against the other Council ambitions to make this a health city. I hope you can reassure us that you are getting to grips with this.

Reply: *County Councillor Bradbury*

We are getting to grips with this, and health options in Leisure Centres are fundamental to what we are trying to do. We have got lots of social enterprises in Leisure Centres and cafes which do offer healthy options. We were specifically talking about vending machines in that quote. I have to say Councillor if there is a problem with healthy options in Leisure Centres then you had 8 years as a Cabinet Member to deal with it. To be fair you started to address these issues and we continued by the removal of bars in Leisure Centres, we are trying to remove bars in Leisure Centres, that's a healthy option.

We are also investing quite a heavy amount of money in our Leisure Centres, and as you know the Star Hub and Eastern Leisure Centre. I don't think that this Administration, this Council can be criticised for its commitment for healthy living.

17. QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER, TRANSPORT,
PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY

Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

Will the Cabinet Member outline any planned changes to the current bus subsidies operating in Cardiff, in particular the 136 serving the communities of Pentyrch, Creigiau and Gwaelod Y Garth?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

A number of supported bus services, including the 136 service, are supported from the Bus Service Support Grant, which is allocated annually to local authorities by the Welsh Government.

The current level of support has been set for 2014/2015; however, there can be no guarantee of the level of funding provided under this grant will continue in future years.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

I met with the previous Cabinet Member before you had your musical chairs, but luckily he is sat next to you - so perhaps he can pass over some of the notes.

The 136 service is incredibly important to the North West of the city and because there are no other viable options in terms of public transport mainly because of the 600 feet incline there is no trains going that way yet, so the bus service is incredibly important.

Could you be very mindful of that when considering the subsidy to that service because it's a lifeline for the community?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I agree.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

I understand that there is going to be some early budget decisions in the coming months. If there is anything in relation to buses and subsidised services will you be talking with affected Councillors and their Wards in advance of any published reports?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Once I see the report only then can I really comment on those, but at the moment I cannot comment on the individual areas what's happening, but I would certainly want to be able to keep Members informed of those areas but sometimes we are reliant on external services like Cardiff Bus and other organisations to also feed that information back to us.

18. QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER, CORPORATE SERVICES & PERFORMANCE

Question: *County Councillor Robson*

How much will be generated by moving the planning department into County Hall?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

Currently, the Planning Service is divided between City Hall and County Hall. I believe the last people who are staying here are from the Policy Unit who are working very closely with the Planning Inspectorate on the LDP - so for good reason. The move will result in improved service delivery, customer engagement and deliver of outcome, which should also help to generate a significant increase in planning fee income.

The move will create space within City Hall for Civil Parking Enforcement Officers to relocate officers in Charles Street, which is leased at a cost of £150k per year.

In addition, as a result of the relocation, the service will no longer incur charges for the use of the NCP car park in Dumfries Place, which is estimated annual saving of £13k.

Overall I would surmise that the move will fit in with our Property Strategy and improve an immediate reduction in cost.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Robson*

It just seemed to me, perhaps somebody as a back bencher, that hasn't be fully involved in the full strategy of which departments end where, that we are playing a bit of a merry-go-round. As you say the Strategic Planning Department recently moved from County Hall up here to City Hall and within a matter of months you send their Development Control colleagues back down to County Hall. My first thought was that they don't get on but I know that's not the case, but it just seems that there is a bit of a merry-go-round.

You answered some of the questions by explaining that the space created will be used for and I welcome that there will be a saving there. It would be useful for Members to be briefed more prominently so that we know what is going and the rationale behind it, you've explained it today but I didn't know that until I asked the question and also the costs of the moves as well would be useful to have.

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

If I misled you there Councillor Robson, I did say that the Policy Unit is still here working very closely with the Inspectorate Team at the moment. The Development Officers are over at County Hall and the overall saving is to relocate external costs into our building.

I will drop you a line about the overall costs but we are looking at probably around £88k per year

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Huw Thomas*

I appreciate and I applaud the efforts that the Council is making to best use our estate facilities to our advantage to save costs in this time of austerity. I am also grateful for the consultation exercise that you initialised recently to explore the views of what Members required at County Hall.

Could I ask you to commit at this point to share the results of that consultation with Members before committing to any spend as a result of that. I would hate personally, I am sure everybody in this room would also agree, at a time of austerity to be spending funds on redecorating and making more comfortable facilities for Councillors when Council staff are under immense pressure.

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

I am sure you are aware that as a Council develops and shrinks and becomes more efficient in that respect, next to our largest cost which is obviously people is property, and we need to be much more focussed on the use of our buildings and external costs more this year than ever before and I am sure you are aware of that.

I will therefore be bringing forward very soon a property strategy to look at to see where we need to be to offset our external costs and concentrate more on our building and I am sure that people will welcome that, and I will be taking that to Scrutiny very shortly.

19. QUESTION TO THE CABINET MEMBER, ENVIRONMENT

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

Is the Waste Management service considering charging residents to take rubbish to the household amenity centres?

Reply: *County Councillor Derbyshire*

I was a bit surprised at the question because it was something that was news to be but I have checked, just to make sure that officers weren't doing something that I was not aware of. I can confirm that we are not considering charging residents for using the Household Waste Recycling Centres for domestic waste.

20. QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER, HEALTH, HOUSING AND WELLBEING

Question: *County Councillor Carter*

Could the Cabinet Member outline her proposals to retender the Direct Payment Support Provider Retender contract?

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

Commissioning of Direct Payment support provision will be taken forward in accordance with the Council's commissioning and procurement regulations. The current contract for Direct Payment support which was due to end in March of this year was extended by Direct Award by twelve months to March 2015

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Carter*

Would you agree with me that that aside from looking at the raw cost of provision we need to think about the bigger picture in terms of what facilities are being provided in any support provider. I am conscious that we are going to be scrutinising this at CASSC towards the end of the year and I welcome your appearance at that Committee, but I am mindful, my question is, are you mindful and as concerned as I am, about the prospect of perhaps retendering to low and having unforeseen consequences, such as a knock on effect in the increase in Direct Payments that you are looking to achieve in your administration

Reply: *County Councillor Elsmore*

We have obviously given a very clear commitment as an administration; we have a stretched target to provide increased Direct Payments to individuals; rather it is through Direct Payments that individuals are able to exercise choice and control in relation to those services.

21. QUESTION TO CABINET MEMBER, EARLY YEARS,
CHILDREN AND FAMILIES

Question: *County Councillor Graham*

Following the much publicized and aborted attempt to use 150 Thornhill Road as young offenders centre, the former Cabinet Member for Children's Services was advised that a disposal of the site was in the best interests of all concerned. Taking into account the Officers' advice to dispose, the ongoing costs being currently incurred, the £2 million original cost and the high resale value of the site, will the current Cabinet Member proceed with the disposal as soon as possible, to release much needed funds into the Children's Services budget?

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

As I confirmed to you in response to a previous question at Council in July, officers from several Directorates have been actively considering these options in order to maximise the value of the asset for the benefit of Cardiff citizens.

I can further confirm that a report is now expected to be considered at the Cabinet Meeting in November. This report will set out clear recommendations for future use or sale and the related consultation requirements based on the options appraisal undertaken.

The receipt from the sale or appropriation of the land will be ring fenced for investment by Children's Services.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Evans*

Can you confirm that the proposal, the original proposal was actually in relation to the relocation of the Youth Offending Team, and not the establishment of a Young Offenders Centre? I think it is important to be precise about the language that we use.

Reply: *County Councillor Lent*

I can confirm that what you are saying is correct; it was relocation of the actual team.

73 : NOTICES OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor advised there were two Notices of Motion.

Motion 1

The following Notice of Motion was moved ***Councillor*** Clark and seconded by Councillor Kelloway.

This Council notes with great concern that the recycling rates in Cardiff have fallen. The percentage of municipal waste prepared for reuse, recycled or composted recycling in Cardiff between 2012/13 to 2013/14 fell from 52% to 50% according to Welsh Government figures published in August 2014.

In 2004 when the Liberal Democrats first led Cardiff Council they inherited a 14% recycling rate from the previous Labour administration. By the end of 2011/2012 it had increased to 51%.

This fall in recycling rates is particularly shocking because rates rose across Wales as a whole between 2012/13 to 2013/14 by 2% to 54%.

Moreover, the challenging infrastructure changes necessary to improve recycling rates in Cardiff had already been made by May 2012. This included the introduction of weekly green recycling bag collections, separate caddies for food waste, the establishment of 4 Household Waste Recycling Centres across the city and ensuring very transient wards had collections on the same day to minimise confusion.

Despite the current Labour administration promising to fulfil “its recycling responsibilities” in their 2012 Local Election manifesto, Cardiff is now at risk of missing the 58% recycling target by 2015/16 set by the Welsh Government and as a result incurring heavy fines.

This Council calls for the ruling administration to take urgent action to address the problem.

There were two amendments to the Notice of Motion as proposed.

Amendment 1

The following amendment was proposed by Councillor McKerlich and seconded by Councillor Walker.

Penultimate Paragraph - inclusion of the word '*arbitrarily*' after 2015/16

Last Paragraph - after the word administration the deletion of the words '*to take urgent action to address the problem.*' and replace with '*enter into serious discussions with the Welsh Government about setting more appropriate, lower recycling targets.*'

The Substantive Motion will then read:

“This Council notes with great concern that the recycling rates in Cardiff have fallen. The percentage of municipal waste prepared for reuse, recycled or composted recycling in Cardiff between 2012/13 to 2013/14 fell from 52% to 50% according to Welsh Government figures published in August 2014.

In 2004 when the Liberal Democrats first led Cardiff Council they inherited a 14% recycling rate from the previous Labour administration. By the end of 2011/2012 it had increased to 51%.

This fall in recycling rates is particularly shocking because rates rose across Wales as a whole between 2012/13 to 2013/14 by 2% to 54%.

Moreover, the challenging infrastructure changes necessary to improve recycling rates in Cardiff had already been made by May 2012. This included the introduction of weekly green recycling bag collections, separate caddies for food waste, the establishment of 4 Household Waste Recycling Centres across the city and ensuring very transient wards had collections on the same day to minimise confusion.

Despite the current Labour administration promising to fulfil “its recycling responsibilities” in their 2012 Local Election manifesto, Cardiff is now at risk of missing the 58% recycling target by 2015/16, arbitrarily set by the Welsh Government and as a result incurring heavy fines.

This Council calls for the ruling administration enter into serious discussions with the Welsh Government about setting more appropriate, lower recycling targets.”

Amendment 2

The following amendment was proposed by Councillor Robson and seconded by Councillor Cowan

.

Delete all of the words after first paragraph and insert the following: - .

‘Cardiff is now at risk of missing the 58% recycling target by 2015/16 set by the Welsh Government and as a result incurring heavy fines. This Council calls for the ruling administration to take urgent action to address the problem and further calls on the cabinet to produce an action plan within 3 months detailing how the 58% target will be met.’

The Substantive Motion will read:

This Council notes with great concern that the recycling rates in Cardiff have fallen. The percentage of municipal waste prepared for reuse, recycled or composted recycling in Cardiff between 2012/13 to 2013/14 fell from 52% to 50% according to Welsh Government figures published in August 2014.

Cardiff is now at risk of missing the 58% recycling target by 2015/16 set by the Welsh Government and as a result incurring heavy fines.

This Council calls for the ruling administration to take urgent action to address the problem and further calls on the cabinet to produce an action plan within 3 months detailing how the 58% target will be met.

Following a debate a vote was taken on the Amendment 1 as proposed.

Amendment 1 was lost.

A vote was taken on Amendment 2 as proposed.

Amendment 2 was lost.

A vote was taken on the Notice of Motion as proposed.

The Motion was lost.

Motion 2

The following Notice of Motion was moved Councillor Elsmore and seconded by Councillor Hunt.

There were no amendments to the Motion as proposed

This Council resolves to:

- Work towards making the City of Cardiff a dementia supportive community, a status officially endorsed by the Alzheimer's Society, and
- Become a council where each elected member signs up to registering as a Dementia friend, and
- Create and appoint an elected member to the position of Dementia Champion and appoint a lead officer for dementia, and
- Continue to work jointly with partners from the statutory, voluntary and independent sectors to develop and improve services for people living with dementia and their carers.

There were no amendments

A vote was taken on the Notice of Motion as proposed.

The Motion was carried unanimously.

74 : URGENT BUSINESS

In accordance with the pilot Council Procedure Rule 3(xv) the Lord Mayor advised that he had not been notified of any urgent matters for this meeting.

75 : LOCAL AUTHORITY APPOINTMENTS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed in the Appendix to the report, and as shown on the Amendment Sheet.

The nominations were proposed by Councillor Hunt and seconded by Councillor Gordon.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments of School Governors be approved as follows : -

<u>School</u>	<u>Ward</u>	<u>Start of Vacancy</u>	<u>Applications</u>
Cantonian High School	Fairwater	22/02/2014	Mr Alvyn Morgan
Bishop of Llandaff C/W High School	Llandaff	22/07/2014	Mrs Sarah Cullen
Llanishen High School	Llanishen	23/09/2014	
Radyr Comprehensive School	Radyr	16/08/2014	Mr John Wilson
Creigiau Primary School	Creigiau	03/10/2012	Mrs Eleri Rees
Meadowlane Primary School	Trowbridge	15/11/2013	Mr John Dyer
Severn Primary School	Riverside	22/05/2014	Mr Gareth Jones
Ysgol Glan Ceubal	Llandaff North	23/03/2013	Ms Susan White
All Saints C/W Primary School	Pentwyn	22/10/2014	Mrs Amanda Williams

UNOPPOSED COUNCIL BUSINESS

76 : REGULATORY COMMERCIAL SERVICES DELEGATIONS

Council was asked to approve the arrangements necessary for the effective discharge of consumer protection and illegal money lending functions and to approve the necessary delegations.

RESOLVED – That

- 1) delegate authority be granted to the Assistant Director, Environment and or the Operational Manager- Regulatory Commercial Services, in consultation with the City and County Solicitor, to enter into legal agreements with other local authorities, as and when it is appropriate and in the interests of the proper and

efficient discharge of the Council's Consumer Protection functions and where those functions are Executive functions, to:

- (i) delegate the discharge of any such consumer protection functions to another local authority or its executive as appropriate, and or
 - (ii) arrange for City of Cardiff Council to discharge any consumer protection functions of the other authority,
- 2) delegate authority be granted to the Assistant Director, Environment and or the Operational Manager- Regulatory Commercial Services, in consultation with the City and County Solicitor, to enter into legal agreements with other Welsh local authorities, as and when it is appropriate and in the interests of the proper and efficient discharge of the Council's illegal money lending functions, and where those functions are Executive functions, to arrange for City of Cardiff Council's Illegal Money Lending Unit to discharge the illegal money lending functions of the other authority or authorities

77 : NOMINATIONS TO COUNCIL COMMITTEES AND MEMBER CHAMPION

Council receive nominations from party groups to current Committee vacancies in accordance with the allocation of seats as agreed by Council at its Annual Meeting on 29 May 2014, and to the vacant role of Member Champion for Diversity and Equalities in accordance with the decision of Full Council on 24 July 2014 (Min No 59) to appoint three Member Champions.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) appointment of Councillor Cecilia Love as Member Champion for Diversity and Equalities be approved ;
- (2) the nominations received to the vacancies on Committees as set out on the amendment sheet be approved as follows:

<u>Committee</u>	<u>Nomination</u>
Audit Committee	Councillor Robson to replace Councillor Cowan

Corporate Parenting Advisory Committee	Councillors Goddard, Joyce and Sanders
Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee	Councillor Ralph Cook to replace Councillor Corria
Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee	Cllr Goodway to replace Councillor Knight; Councillor Cowan to replace Councillor Robson

(Formal Meeting closed at 20.45pm)

In accordance with pilot Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) the following Written Questions were received for considerations and response ahead of this meeting. A full copy of all written questions together with the answers were circulated to Members by email and published on the website in advance of the Council meeting and are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

77 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE QUESTIONS

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

How many of Cardiff Council's Corporate Directors and Chief Officers live within the city & county of Cardiff?

How many do not?

Reply

In terms of the Council's Senior Management Team, 5 persons live within the City & County of Cardiff and 13 do not.

Please note that there is no requirement for any council employee to live within the city's administrative boundaries.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

What specific steps is the Cabinet taking to reduce agency spend in the current year and in preparation for the projected future budgetary constraints?

Reply

Management actions to restrict spend were set out by the Chief Executive earlier in the year as part of the measures to address the Council's overspend in the 2014/15 financial year. This was outlined in detail in paragraph 7 of the 'Budget Monitoring – Month 4 Report', which was considered by the Cabinet on 18 September 2014.

The specific wording contained in that report in relation to Staffing Arrangements and agency spend was as follows:

“review and limit any new agency engagements or extensions to current agency engagements”

Monthly monitoring data on agency spend is provided to all Directors to enable the review of ongoing requirements.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

What is the projected spend on statutory and discretionary redundancy payments (itemised separately) for the current year and forecast for the 2015/16 financial year?

Is there an intention to review current policy on Council compromise agreements?

Reply

1. The spend in relation to redundancy payments for 2014/15 up until the end of August 2014 is £1 million. The breakdown between statutory and discretionary payments will be provided following a reconciliation exercise which is currently being undertaken. In 2013/14, the split was 39% statutory costs and 61% discretionary costs.

The projected spend for the full year for 2014/15 and 2015/16 is not known as the figure is dependent upon financial pressures and

savings proposals within directorates and the individual circumstances of employees.

The Budget Report for 2014/15, which was approved by Council in February 2014, included a financial model in respect of the costs in relation to redundancy payments and how these would be funded. The assumptions within this model were that redundancy payments would be around £10.055 million in 2014/15 and £8.155 million in 2015/16. As noted above, these costs are complex to model and dependent upon an individual's circumstances.

2. Yes, a review of settlement agreements (previously known as compromise agreements) is proposed as part of the corporate review of the Council's voluntary severance scheme.

EARLY YEARS, CHILDREN AND FAMILIES

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How children are on the child protection register?

Reply

At 31st July 2014, there were 285 children on the child protection register.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Does every child on the child protection register have an allocated social worker?

Reply

Yes.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

With reference to all social workers who are dealing with children on the Child Protection Register, as of 31-07-14 how many cases does each social worker have for their entire case workload?

Reply

50 social workers had responsibility for one or more of the 285 children on the Child Protection Register as at 31st July 2014.

Of the 50 (6 of whom are not full-time equivalents), the overall caseload ranged from 11 to 39, which represents an average of 25.5.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many children are Cardiff Children's Services dealing with as of 31-07-14?

Reply

2,861

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many families are Cardiff Children's Services dealing with as of 31-07-14?

Reply

There is no single definition of what constitutes a 'family' given that many children move between different branches of the same family. Based on the number of children that we were working with as at 31st July 2014, Cardiff Children's Services were dealing with 1,390 families.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many social workers are employed by Cardiff Children's Services on full time permanent contracts as of 31-07-14, please specify gender?

Reply

As at 31st July 2014, there were 102 permanent, full-time Social Workers employed within Children's Services. Of these, 81 are female and 21 are male.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many part time permanent social workers does Cardiff Children's Services employ, please specify gender?

Reply

As at 31st July 2014, there were 30 permanent, part-time Social Workers employed within Children's Services. Of these, 28 are female and 2 are male.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many agency staff is Cardiff Children's Services using as of 31-07-14?

Reply

Cardiff Children's Services were using 77 agency staff as at 31st July 2014, inclusive of all grades, levels of qualification and designations.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What was the total annual budget spent by Cardiff Children's Services from 1999 to 2014?

Reply

The Cardiff Children's Services expenditure budget from 2000 is detailed below. Prior to this, it formed part of the wider Social Services Department.

<u>Year</u>	<u>Budget £'000</u>
2014/15	44,921
2013/14	45,946
2012/13	42,480
2011/12	40,658
2010/11	37,212
2009/10	36,498
2008/09	36,345
2007/08	36,540
2006/07	34,468
2005/06	26,893
2004/05	20,504
2003/04	20,690
2002/03	18,856
2001/02	16,440
2000/01	16,049

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many children on the Child Protection Register are educated in school, please give in figures and as a percentage?

Reply

At 31st July 2014, 150 of the 285 children on the child protection register were of statutory school age (53%). These children are all entitled to full time school education. The number who are provided with specialised home tuition or educated otherwise at any one time is low.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

How many social workers in Cardiff Children's Services would be described as "managers", please give grade and salary as of 31-07-14?

Reply

Of the registered Social Workers employed by Cardiff Children's Services, the following have a management post:

- Director x 1 (Spot Salary = £120,000)
- Operational Manager x 1 (Level 1 with salary range of £52,545-£64,032)
- Operational Manager x 1 (Level 2 with salary range of £43,002-£51,945)
- Service Manager x 3 (Grade 10 with salary range of £36,676-£39,351)
- Team Managers x 21 (Grade 10 with salary range of £36,676-£39,351)
- Registered Manager x 1 (Grade 9 with salary range of £33,998-£36,676)
- Team Managers x 1 (Grade 8 with salary range of £30,311-£33,998)
- Team Leaders x 1 (Grade 7 with salary range of £26,539-£30,311)

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

To which domestic abuse charities can Cardiff Children's Services refer females for non judgemental support?

Reply

The organisations who are involved in working and engaging with either victims or perpetrators of Domestic Abuse do so in a non judgemental way such as Cardiff Women's Aid and Safer Wales alongside BAWSO and Barnardo's.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

To which domestic abuse charities can Cardiff Children's Services refer males for non judgemental support?

Reply

The organisations who are involved in working and engaging with either victims or perpetrators of Domestic Abuse practice in a non judgemental way. Both the Safer Wales Dyn Project and Refuge Against Domestic Violence offer both practical and emotional support. The NSPCC facilitates group programmes for fathers.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

What venues are used for child protection conferences by Cardiff Children's Services, please specify those in or next to schools?

Reply

The following venues are used on a regular basis for child protection conferences:

- St Mellons Family Centre – next door to school
- Llanedeyrn Family Centre – school in the vicinity
- Rainbow House in St Mellons

A specific school may be used to host a child protection conference if considered appropriate and necessary.

EDUCATION AND SKILLS

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

Whereas it is reassuring to hear of incremental improvements of Key Stage 4 outcomes they remain below those of many comparable English cities. We understand that new educational structures have been set up to improve performance, particularly at secondary level. What would be useful would be a clear outline of any new policies and initiatives which have been produced through the establishment of these new structures. Additionally, the specific targets and their rationale which individual schools have been set to improve KS4 and A level results.

Will the cabinet member make this information available to me and other members?

Reply

A number of educational structures are in place to improve performance, particularly at secondary level.

The Welsh Government has introduced the Schools Challenge Cymru (SCC), which is a focused effort to break the link between deprivation and attainment. There are four main themes for the Challenge – leadership; learning and teaching; the pupil; the school & the community.

The 40 schools involved across Wales (including Cantonian High School, Eastern High School, Glyn Derw High School, Michaelston Community College, St Illtyd's Catholic High School and Willows High School in Cardiff) are receiving additional resources and expertise to undertake a programme of swift, sustainable improvement.

Each school has been assigned a SCC Adviser who will take an active role in each school's improvement process. They will support the school in drafting a Single School Development Plan that will drive improvement and include stretching targets for success. Cluster primary schools will also be involved. An Accelerated Improvement Board (AIB) for each school will meet monthly to ensure that the improvement strategies are being implemented effectively and that rapid improvement is being made. A representative from the local authority will sit on the AIB.

In addition, the Central South Wales Challenge is a strategy to develop a self-improving school system across the five local authorities that constitute the Central South Wales Consortium. It is based on the evidence that schools usually have a greater capacity to improve themselves than is currently being mobilised. In other words, schools know more information than they use and working together has enormous potential to drive improvements.

Over 40 School Improvement Groups (SIGs) have been created, involving schools from all five authorities, which will include a mix of schools at different stages of development. Their aim is to improve the performance of every school and all groups of learners, thus increasing the number of good and outstanding schools.

At Key Stage 4, the minimum expectation is that schools set targets which if achieved would place them in the top 25% of similar schools taking into account pupils' prior attainment and school level context factors. These targets are discussed with the school's Challenge Adviser and agreed by the local authority before being finalised and submitted to the Consortium.

At A-level, school targets for Key Stage 5 are not a statutory requirement, but are submitted to the Consortium as part of a local agreement.

School	2014/15 Target L1	2014/15 Target L2	2014/15 Target L2 EWM	2 x A level
Cantonian	92	81	47	98
Cardiff High	100	96	84	100
Cathays	94	79	50	57
Corpus Christi	100	81	81	
Eastern High	88	57	36	
Fitzalan	95	85	51	100
Glyn Derw	95	78	51	
Llanishen	100	83	70	100
Mary Immaculate	96	86	45	
Michaelston Community College	95	70	45	
Radyr	99	90	79	100
St Illtyds	96	71	45	
St Teilo's	97	83	65	98
The Bishop of Llandaff	100	87	74	100
Whitchurch	95	74	64	100
Willows	89	68	45	
Ysgol Gyfun Glantaf	98	85	70	98
Ysgol Gyfun Plasmawr	99	91	84	100

The above targets were submitted last year by Cardiff schools for Key Stage 4 and Key Stage 5 and will be subject to discussion and challenge by the Challenge Adviser as part of the visits in the autumn term.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

It was agreed in principle that the data formerly available which compared Cardiff schools' performance with that of other comparable English cities would be reinstated and circulated to members. When will this information be available regarding the 2013/14 results recently published?

Reply

This information is published annually and was available in the Annual Schools Performance Report that was published in January 2014. It is not the case that it needs to be reinstated. It will be updated in January 2015 as usual.

The provisional data for comparable English cities will be published by the UK Government Department for Education on 23rd October 2014.

Provisional Summary of Secondary School Performance (SSSP) data for Wales will be published on 25th September 2014.

Members will receive this information formally in January 2015 in the report on the Performance of Cardiff Schools.

ENVIRONMENT

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Please set out by ward the number of streets which have had missed refuse collections in each of the last twelve months.

Reply

Whilst records are kept of instances where collections are delayed, this information is not stored in a manner that would allow it to be presented in the format requested (i.e. number of streets per ward). However, further to a similar request, customer reports of missed collections have been recorded on a ward-by-ward basis since April 2014 as follows:

	MISSED COLLECTIONS BY WARD				
	May 2014	June 2014	July 2014	August 2014	TOTAL
Adamsdown	10	9	35	15	69
Butetown	21	29	72	34	156
Caerau	31	64	54	31	180
Canton	35	19	83	39	176
Cathays	23	96	70	41	230
Creigiau & St. Fagans	14	44	27	13	98
Cyncoed	58	48	46	82	234

	MISSED COLLECTIONS BY WARD				
	May 2014	June 2014	July 2014	August 2014	TOTAL
Ely	67	72	91	61	291
Fairwater	50	50	115	36	251
Gabalfa	13	43	28	63	147
Grangetown	35	59	86	64	244
Heath	36	32	84	19	171
Lisvane	17	18	42	16	93
Llandaff	43	109	67	64	283
Llandaff North	25	92	17	19	153
Llanishen	95	52	88	40	275
Llanrumney	31	45	141	47	264
Pentwyn	41	88	66	49	244
Pentyrch	3	3	48	8	62
Penylan	40	85	51	103	279
Plasnewydd	30	41	95	57	223
Pontprennau & Old St. Mellons	23	36	59	35	153
Radyr	26	112	35	40	213
Rhiwbina	38	32	60	28	158
Riverside	54	58	84	37	233
Rumney	18	30	98	21	167
Splott	46	48	48	45	187
Trowbridge	52	58	104	77	291
Whitchurch & Tongwynlais	42	81	50	46	219
TOTAL	1017	1553	1944	1230	5744

To put this data into context, the Waste Management service undertakes 3 collections per property per week. With approximately 152,000 properties in Cardiff, this equates to over 450,000 collections per week and over 23 million collections per annum.

Therefore, to have only 5744 reported non collections out of nearly 8 million scheduled collections over a 4 month period represents less than 0.1% of the total collections undertaken.

That said, the service continues to address any causes within their control to avoid missed collections, including round rebalancing and improved support services provision such as fleet management.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Will the council re-consult residents in streets like Soberton Avenue and Manor Street to see if they would be amenable to having wheelie bins instead of bag collections?

Reply

I am currently in discussion with officers on the logistics and costs of new proposals for a wheeled bin expansion programme.

The benefits of wheeled bins are clear – less litter and seagull attacks; they are safer for operatives and residents and, most of all, they encourage recycling as people can no longer put out an unlimited amount of black bags.

Detailed plans will be developed and shared with the relevant local members over the coming months.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD

Since the closure of Waungron Road re-cycling centre there has been a vast increase in Fly-tipping in Cardiff West, at what extra cost?

Reply

There has been no “vast increase” in fly tipping in Cardiff West.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

At this time of year footways can become narrowed by overgrowth from private gardens. In response to local complaints about this matter, officers have confirmed that ‘there are no set criteria for adequate footpath clearance’. They also state that even when shrubs and branches intrude on public access that they ‘do not ask householders to cut back overgrowth unless it is causing an obstruction’.

Could the cabinet member look at policy in this area so that pavements and rights of way remain unhindered by overgrowth, establishing the criteria and rules for dealing with this nuisance which those with enforcement responsibility currently lack?

Reply

The Council take public safety very seriously and, by way of background, the Council exercises the provisions as set out under Section 154 of the Highways Act 1980 in order to deal with the scenario that you describe.

There are not set criteria contained within the relevant section(s) of the Act which explicitly define what constitutes an obstruction, the Act determines that :

“Where a hedge, tree or shrub overhangs a highway or any other road or footpath to which the public has access so as to endanger or obstruct the passage of vehicles or pedestrians, or obstructs or interferes with the view of drivers of vehicles or the light from a public lamp, or overhangs a highway so as to endanger or obstruct the passage of horse riders, a competent authority may, by notice either to the owner of the hedge, tree or shrub or to the occupier of the land on which it is growing, require him within 14 days from the date of service of the notice so to lop or cut it as to remove the cause of danger, obstruction or interference’

In the absence of an explicit definition inspecting officers are required to apply logic and exercise discretion at the time of inspection in order to reach a decision as whether or not to issue a notice, in doing considering the pertinent factors which are predominately, the degree of overhang, the width of the footpath or roadway and / or proximity of the highway in and some instances disputes between neighbours / within the local community.

In view of the above inspecting officers do not always issue notices on owner / occupiers where vegetation overhangs a footpath, roadway or highway. The council will however issue notices on owner / occupiers where vegetation overhangs to an extent that causes an obstruction and as a result poses a risk to public safety in accordance with the Act. Indeed to issue notices as a matter of routine to owner / occupiers and whereby overhang exists could be seen as a heavy handed, unreasonable approach and not the best use of Council resources.

LEADER – ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PARTNERSHIPS

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DIANNE REES

What is the current position with Central Bus Station?

Reply

As you will be aware, we are working closely with partners to deliver a new world-class ‘Integrated Transport Hub’, which will replace the existing city centre bus station.

At present, a consultation exercise is currently ongoing to seek views from the public regarding the future development of the station. Details regarding the future development of the station will be developed using the outcomes of the consultation.

The consultation period ends on 3rd October. A report on the outcome of the consultation is due to be presented to Cabinet in December for a decision on the way forward.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DIANNE REES

What effect will the plans for Central Bus station have on National Express Bus stops in the near future?

Reply

Details of the future impact on existing National Express Coach facilities at Central Bus Station will emerge from the current consultation exercise and subsequent report to Cabinet in December 2014.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DIANNE REES

What effect will the proposed changes have on the taxi rank at the Central Bus station and the pick up, drop off bays there?

Reply

Details of the future impact on existing taxi facilities at Central Bus Station will emerge from the current consultation exercise and subsequent report to Cabinet in December 2014.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WALKER

Will the cabinet member update Council on recent meetings with Celsa regarding the refilling of Llanishen Reservoir, their timing, content and outcomes?

Reply

I have to declare a personal interest in this matter.

I am aware that recent discussions have been held between the Directors of Economic Development and Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport with the Managing Director of Celsa.

Company officials reiterated their willingness to engage with the local community regarding plans for the reservoirs. However, they did point out that they are still waiting to conclude negotiations with Welsh Water and, as soon as these have been finalised, further discussions will then take place.

TRANSPORT, PLANNING AND SUSTAINABILITY

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Please will you update me on the Cabinet's response to the petition which I submitted in September last year calling for a resurfacing of Heathfield Road and Heathfield Place?

Reply

I am pleased to confirm that Heathfield Road and Heathfield Place have been selected for inclusion in the surface treatment programme for the current financial year. Details were circulated by email to all Members on 10 September 2014.

The treatment is weather sensitive and, as a result of this and the scale of the programme, a precise date cannot be provided at the present time. However, the anticipated programme start date is February / March 2015.

When a firm programme has been agreed and dates set, the communication process will begin where members and residents will be provided with key dates prior to commencement of works on site.

Chair: _____

Date: _____